

Board of Governors Open Session Minutes

Friday, December 16, 2016 Council Chamber, 2-100 University Hall 8:00 AM - 12:00 PM

ATTENDEES:

Voting Members:

Michael Phair Appointed Chair, General Public
Shenaz Jeraj Appointed Vice-Chair, General Public
Dick Wilson Appointed Vice-Chair, General Public

Colin Champagne Appointed Member, Undergraduate Student Representative to Board of Governors

Sarah Ficko Appointed Member, President, Graduate Students' Association

James Heelan Appointed Member, General Public

Barry James Appointed Member, University of Alberta Senate Representative

LeRoy Johnson Appointed Member, General Public Raymond Muzyka Appointed Member, General Public

Robert Parks Appointed Member, University of Alberta Alumni Association Representative

Fahim Rahman Appointed Member, President, Students' Union

Douglas Stollery Appointed Member, Chancellor

Glenn Stowkowy Appointed Member, University of Alberta Alumni Association Representative

David Turpin Appointed Member, President and Vice-Chancellor

Non-Voting Officials Appointed by the President:

Steven Dew Provost and Vice-President (Academic)

Marion Haggarty-France University Secretary Brad Hamdon General Counsel

Gitta Kulczycki Vice-President (Finance and Administration)

Heather McCaw Vice-President (Advancement)

Andrew Sharman Vice-President (Facilities and Operations)

Catherine Swindlehurst Chief of Staff (President's Office)

Jacqui Tam Interim Vice-President (University Relations)
Juli Zinken Board Secretary and Manager of Board Services

Regrets:

Lorne Babiuk Vice-President (Research)

Faiza Billo Appointed Member, Non-Academic Staff Representative (NASA Appointee)

David Cooper Appointed Member, Academic Staff Representative (AASUA Appointee)

Jeremy Richards Appointed Member, Academic Staff Representative (General Faculties Council)

Nizar Somji Appointed Member, General Public

Presenter(s):

Richard Fedorak Dean, Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry
Martin Ferguson-Pell Vice-Provost (Strategic Initiatives)

Dolores March Director, Hospitality Services, Ancillary Services

Logan Mardhani-Bayne Initiatives Manager, Audit & Analysis

Mary Persson Associate Vice-President (Audit and Analysis) and University Auditor

Philip Stack Associate Vice-President (Risk Management Services)

Associate Vice-President (Risk Management Services)

Sarah Wolgemuth Assistant Dean (Student Life), Dean of Students

Staff:

Erin Plume, Assistant Board Secretary

OPENING SESSION

1. Chair's Session

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

1a. Call to Order and Confirmation of Quorum

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

The Board Secretary confirmed that the attendance constituted quorum. The Chair called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m.

1b. Approval of Open Session Agenda

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

The Chair reminded members that a revised agenda was circulated on Tuesday with the addition of Items 4biv - Calgary Centre - Lease Renewal; and 5b - Fees for Meal Services in Lister Residence 2017 – 2018.

The motion was moved and seconded.

THAT the Board of Governors approve the revised Open Session agenda as presented.

CARRIED

1c. Conflict of Interest - Opportunity for Declaration

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

The Chair made note of the following:

- The University of Alberta has policy and procedure in place for Conflict of Interest and Conflict of Commitment, and Board members make annual disclosures.
- o In addition, Board members must declare any conflict related to the Board Agenda of each meeting and, in the event of such conflict, absent themselves from the discussion and voting on the item.
- The *Post-secondary Learning Act*, Section 16(5) states that: The members of the board must act in the best interests of the university.

The Chair invited members to declare conflicts of interest related to the Open Session Agenda of the meeting. Mr Parks declared a conflict with Item 4biii, 2017-2018 Visitor Parking Rates, as his firm has done consulting work related to parking on South Campus; Mr Rahman declared a conflict with Item 5b, Meal Plan for Lister Residence 2017-2018, informing the Board that the current meal plan is available for use in the Students' Union Building and contributes to a small portion of the Students' Union's budget; Mr Stowkowy declared a general conflict in that his firm does work for the University of Alberta; and Mr James reminded members that he is Chair of the Audit Committee for the Province of Alberta and that the university's financial statements are approved by this committee.

Seeing no further declarations, the Chair declared the question asked and answered.

1d. Chair's Remarks

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

The Chair welcomed members and guests and acknowledged all Indigenous peoples and the traditional lands on which the Board was gathered.

He offered a warm welcome to new alumni representative, Glenn Stowkowy, who was appointed at the end of June but was attending his first Board of Governors' meeting, and to new Vice-President (Finance and Administration), Gitta Kulczycki.

The Chair then informed members that this would be the final Board of Governors' meeting for two public members, James Heelan and Shenaz Jeraj, noting that although Mr Heelan and Ms Jeraj are currently serving their 90-day override period until the Minister appoints their replacements, the next Board meeting is subsequent to those 90 days.

The Chair individually recognized both members for their service to the Board. He thanked Mr Heelan for his three years of service including as a member on the Investment Committee, as Board representative on the Senate, and as Vice-Chair and now Chair of the Human Resources and Compensation Committee. He then acknowledged Ms Jeraj's extensive service to the university since her appointment 6.5 years ago, serving as Vice-Chair of the Board, as Chair of the Learning and Discovery Committee, as a member of the Audit and Human Resources and Compensation Committees, as Board representative on the Senate, as the Board's representative on Presidential Visiting Committees, and in numerous other roles on behalf of the Board of Governors. Members joined the Chair in recognizing both members for their service and dedication to the Board and the university.

The Chair briefed the Board on a recent meeting of provincial post-secondary institution board chairs with the Minister of Advanced Education, the Honourable Marlin Schmidt, at which the Minister spoke to five core principles guiding the government's vision for post-secondary education: Accessibility, Affordability, Quality, Coordination and Accountability. The Chair also informed members of a meeting between local post-secondary institution board chairs and Edmonton Mayor, Don Iveson.

Finally, the Chair referenced a recent letter he had received from Minister Schmidt in response to the University of Alberta's 2016-2019 *Comprehensive Institutional Plan* (CIP) submission, asking President Turpin to say a few words related to the letter's content regarding international students. Dr Turpin informed the Board that international students do not displace Albertan and Canadian students and noted that the University of Alberta recruits international students in order to provide them with a world-class education while also providing local students with a more international education.

1di. The Governors of the University of Alberta Mandate and Roles Document

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Marion Haggarty-France; Michael Phair

Purpose of the Proposal: To perform the annual affirmation of The Governors of the University of Alberta Mandate and Roles Document, as required by legislation.

Discussion:

The Board received the mandates and roles document for information. There was no discussion of this item.

2. Report of the President

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): David Turpin

Discussion:

In addition to his written report, President Turpin provided verbal points of interest to the Board on: the new format of his report to the Board, indicating that it now follows the layout of *For the Public Good* and highlights key talking points; and his recent trip to India, noting that there is strong interest among Indian institutions in building relationships and partnering with the University of Alberta.

2a. For the Public Good Performance Measures

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): David Turpin; Mary Persson

Purpose of the Proposal: In July 2016, the university established an advisory group to recommend a framework for reporting on performance against For the Public Good. This document presents preliminary recommendations for input by the university community.

Discussion:

Dr Turpin briefed the Board on the status of the preliminary recommendations for performance indicators of *For the Public Good*, informing members that the measures had evolved slightly since the last Board of Governors' meeting where they were discussed.

A member expressed support for the internal and external indicators, and Ms Persson responded to questions from the Board regarding: whether "employment in the relevant field" is an indicator; whether or not the Board would see internal measures; and whether reporting would include metrics on Campus Food Bank usage and mental health services.

3. Safety Moment

Presenter(s): Philip Stack

Purpose of the Proposal: For information/discussion.

Discussion:

Mr Stack presented the Safety Moment, entitled "Leadership as a Driver of Change", noting that health and safety programs are often instituted only after an incident has occurred and that a culture of safety starts at the very top of any organization. He explained that the university has a moral imperative to ensure the safety of staff and students and that investing in health and safety also leads to increased productivity and reduced costs. He informed members that the university's commitment to health and safety starts with *For the Public Good* and that the Board of Governors is responsible for holding administration accountable for these strategies and objectives.

Mr Stack responded to questions from the Board regarding: a suggestion to include the Board of Governors on the leadership slide in the presentation; what approaches the university takes for compliance reviews and spot audits; which areas of the university are more susceptible to health and safety risks and whether there is a particular focus on those areas; and whether or not other post-secondary institutions have a similar emphasis on safety culture.

Members acknowledged Mr Stack and his team for their continuing strong progress in this area.

4. Approval of the Consent Agenda

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

At the request of a Board member, the Chair removed Item 4bii - 2017-2018 Residence Rental Rates Proposal from the Consent Agenda.

Action Items

- 4a. Approval of the Open Session Minutes of October 21, 2016
- 4b. Report of the Board Finance and Property Committee
- 4bi. University of Alberta 2017-2018 General Tuition Fee Proposal
- 4bii. 2017-2018 Residence Rental Rates Proposal item removed
- 4biii. 2017-2018 Visitor Parking Rates
- 4biv. Calgary Centre Lease Renewal
- 4c. Report of the Board Human Resources and Compensation Committee
- 4ci. Proposed Changes to the University Equity Statement in the Academic Staff Posting and Advertising Procedure and the Support Staff Posting and Advertising Procedure
- 4d. Report of the Board Safety, Health and Environment Committee
- 4di. Proposed Changes to the University Infectious Diseases Regulation
- 4e. Report of the Board Chair
- 4ei. Committee Appointments

Information Reports

- 4f. Report of the Audit Committee
- 4g. Report of the Finance and Property Committee
- 4h. Report of the Human Resources and Compensation Committee
- 4i. Report of the Investment Committee
- 4j. Report of the Learning and Discovery Committee
- 4k. Report of the Safety, Health and Environment Committee
- 4l. Report of the University Relations Committee

Regular Reports

- 4m. Chancellor's Report
- 4n. Alumni Association
- 4o. Students' Union (including 2015-16 financial statements)
- 4p. Graduate Students' Association
- 4q. Association of Academic Staff
- 4r. Non-Academic Staff Association
- 4s. General Faculties Council
- 4t. Board Chair and Board Members Activity Report

The motion was moved and seconded.

THAT the Board of Governors approve the Open Session Consent Agenda, as amended.

CARRIED

ACTION ITEMS

4bii. 2017-2018 Residence Rental Rates Proposal

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Andrew Sharman

Purpose of the Proposal: To present for recommended board approval: residence rental rate increases for 2017-2018.

Discussion:

Mr Sharman responded to a Board member's question regarding why the rent for newer residence buildings is being increased faster than that of other residences, particularly considering that the newer residences are already more expensive. He informed the Board that the new residences are 100 percent debt-financed and that rent increases are necessary to fund ongoing maintenance and renewal and to avoid larger rent increases in the future.

Mr Sharman also responded to questions from members regarding: whether the university will have a competitive disadvantage given rental rates around the city; the university's current residence occupancy rates and how they compare with those of other provincial post-secondary institutions; clarification that debt-financing is fixed for a long period and that eventually the lower fixed rates will be a positive; an update on the uptake to the university's guaranteed residence placement for first-year students; and how the university has budgeted for future deferred maintenance and capital projects.

The motion was moved and seconded.

THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Board Finance and Property Committee, approve the 2017-2018 Residence Rental Rate proposal as set forth in Attachment 1, effective May 1, 2017.

CARRIED

Mr Rahman opposed.

5. Report of the Finance and Property Committee

Presenter(s): Dick Wilson

5a. University of Alberta 2017-2018 International Tuition Fee Proposal

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Steven Dew; Gitta Kulczycki

Purpose of the Proposal: To set international tuition fees for the 2017-2018 academic year.

Discussion:

The Chair briefly highlighted the efforts of university administration and the students in raising issues and working together to develop the recommendations before the Board for this item. He then reviewed the order and process by which the item would be discussed and considered.

President Turpin introduced the item and thanked the students for their leadership on tough issues. He informed the Board that the university's international graduate student fees are notably lower than those of other institutions and result in marginal net revenue. He also acknowledged Graduate Students' Association (GSA) President, Sarah Ficko's concerns that the proposed \$4000 increase to international graduate tuition should be guaranteed cost-neutral, and informed the Board that he would like to propose an amendment to Motion 1, adding the following note to the bottom of the motion: "(g) \$4000 will be cost-neutral and offset by an equal amount of financial support"; as well as an amendment to Motion 2, adding the following to the end of the motion: "and that future tuition increases and changes to offset amounts will be subject to governance review and Board approval."

Dr Dew presented an overview of the proposal, explaining that the proposed \$4000 international graduate adjustment proposal was in essence a "sticker price" marketing strategy intended to boost demand where perceptions of quality are linked to apparent price, and stating that this amount would not increase costs to students, departments or researchers. Dr Dew spoke of the quality of student feedback during consultations on the proposal and indicated that these discussions had led to the proposed motion changes as earlier outlined.

Mr Wilson reviewed the amended motions before the Board, and a Board member expressed confusion over the discrepancy between the various percentages outlined in Motion 1's table and the portion of the motion requesting Board approval for "an increase of 3.02% to international tuition fees." Philip Stack, Associate Vice-President (Risk Management Services), explained that the Board was being asked to approve the 3.02 percent but that the variation in the table was necessary and rounded up to 3.02 percent. Following a discussion, a member proposed that Motion 1 be amended to add the words "across the board" between "an" and "increase" in the motion.

Ms Ficko presented a response on behalf of the GSA, indicating that graduate students were confused, skeptical, and angered by the first two motions, and outlined her concerns regarding a lack of meaningful and collaborative student consultation as well as an absence of research documentation to support the argument that higher tuition is linked to a perception of higher quality of education. She indicated her preference that the increase noted in Motion 1 be adjusted from the 3.02 percent Academic Price Index (API) to Consumer Price Index (CPI) and that Motion 2 be deferred.

Following a brief discussion regarding Ms Ficko's proposed amendments, Ms Ficko proposed instead a formal motion to table both Motions 1 and 2 until further student consultation on the 2017-18 international tuition fee proposal had occurred.

The motion was moved and seconded.

Motion: THAT the Board of Governors table motions I and II until further student consultation on the 2017-18 international tuition fee proposal has occurred.

DEFEATED

Mr Champagne, Ms Ficko, Mr Johnson, Mr Muzyka, and Mr Rahman were in favour.

Students' Union (SU) President Fahim Rahman expressed concerns that this would not be the last increase to international tuition and that continued tuition increases would only decrease accessibility.

Drs Turpin and Dew responded to questions from Board members regarding: whether there was a decrease in quality or quantity of applications; whether the \$4000 would have an impact on current students; why the \$4000 amount wasn't higher given the gap between the UofA and comparable institutions; why the \$4000 was such an important issue for administration; what other initiatives the university is undertaking to improve perceptions regarding the quality of education; what quantitative evidence exists to support the claim that price is an indicator of quality for students; and how this proposed increase will align with an increase in student services.

The motion was moved and seconded, as amended.

Motion 1: THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Board Finance and Property Committee, approve an across the board increase of 3.02% to international tuition fees, effective Fall Term, 2017, as illustrated in the table below:

			Change P ^e	
Undergraduate Pa	2016-17 P ^d	2017-18	\$	%
Arts and Science	\$20,395.20	\$21,009.60	\$614.40	3.01%
Business	\$26,827.84	\$27,636.32	\$808.48	3.01%
Engineering	\$24,474.24	\$25,211.52	\$737.28	3.01%
Juris Doctor (JD) Program	\$44,239.16	\$45,573.48	\$1,334.32	3.02%
Pharmacy	\$38,278.40	\$39,431.68	\$1,153.28	3.01%
Economics Course	\$2,602.20	\$2,680.62	\$78.42	3.01%
			Change Pe	
GraduateP ^a	2016-17 Pd	2017-18	(\$)	(%)
Course Based Masters	\$7,941.60	\$8,181.36	\$239.76	3.02%
Thesis 919 Pb	\$4,955.24	\$5,104.84	\$149.60	3.02%
Thesis Based Masters /PhD Pc	\$6,851.04	\$7,057.80	\$206.76	3.02%
Master's in Business Administration	\$15,549.12	\$16,017.84	\$468.72	3.01%
Integrated Petroleum Geosciences Course	\$1,323.60	\$2,924.12	\$1,600.52	121.28%
International Graduate Tuition Increase Pf	n/a	\$4,000.00 ^g	\$4,000.00	n/a

Notes:

- (a) Values are based on a full-time per term and full-time per year unless otherwise
- (b) Tuition applies to thesis students who were admitted to the program of study prior to Fall 2011 and are assessed the reduced thesis rate.
- (c) Tuition applies to thesis students who were admitted to the program of study beginning in Fall 2011 or later; this is based on an annual fee assessment (including spring/summer).
- (d) As approved by the board December 11, 2015.
- (e) Figures may be rounded downwards at fee index level for administrative purposes, thus lowering the effective year over year percentage increase below 3.02 percent.
- (f) Per year for full time student, excluding Cost recovery and graduate course based Physical Therapy, Occupational Therapy, and Speech masters programs in Faculty of Rehabilitation Medicine.
- (g) \$4000 will be cost-neutral and offset by an equal amount of financial support.

CARRIED

Mr Champagne, Ms Ficko, and Mr Rahman opposed.

The motion was moved and seconded, as amended.

Motion 2: THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Board Finance and Property Committee, approve a tuition increase of \$4,000, not subject to future increases of the Academic Price Index (API), to all international graduate tuition fees except for graduate course-based programs in the Faculty of Rehabilitation Medicine and cost-recovery programs, with the understanding that the increase will be offset by an equal amount of financial support that will be revenue and cost neutral, effective Fall Term, 2017, and that future tuition increases and changes to offset amounts will be subject to governance review and Board approval.

CARRIED

Mr Champagne, Ms Ficko, and Mr Rahman opposed.

The motion was moved and seconded.

Motion 3: THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Board Finance and Property Committee, approve an increase of \$1600.52 per course for international tuition fees in the Integrated Petroleum Geosciences (IPG) program, effective Fall Term, 2017, with the understanding that current students will be grandfathered for one year.

CARRIED

Mr Champagne abstained.

5b. Meal Plan for Lister Residence 2017-2018

Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Andrew Sharman; Dolores March; Sarah Wolgemuth

Purpose of the Proposal: To approve the fees for meal services in Lister Residence for the 2017 – 2018 academic year.

Discussion:

The Chair reviewed the order and process by which the item would be discussed and considered, and President Turpin reminded members of the Board's direction that ancillary services be self-sustaining while still maintaining the quality of its buildings, indicating that this proposal was coming forward within those constraints.

Mr Wilson introduced the motion and noted the timing restrictions on the proposal: that prospective students would begin applying in the new year and that this fee would form part of their decision.

Mr Sharman introduced Ms March and Ms Wolgemuth and provided an overview of the consultation process and discussions with student leaders, including the Residence Budget Advisory Committee (RBAC), noting that this proposal was based on student feedback and was intended to address student concerns regarding flexibility and accessibility. He reviewed the details of the proposal, reminding members of Ancillary Services' mandate to be financially self-sustaining, reviewing its past and current fiscal position and economic sensitivities, and outlining current and proposed dining services locations. Ms March reviewed in detail the variety and amount of student consultation related to price, quality, and meal plan value.

Mr Rahman acknowledged administration's recent attempts to consult with students, noting, however, that it took place during final exams. He expressed concern regarding a seeming financial discrepancy between what would be charged and the money administration would receive, noted that students care deeply about the meal plan, and expressed concerns regarding the accessibility of the meal plan, indicating that there are not enough locations to provide students with flexibility. He recommended a one-year extension to the current meal plan to

allow students and administration to work together to resolve these concerns and asked Board members to consider the student presence at the meeting when voting.

Mr Sharman and Ms Marsh responded to questions from the Board regarding: why students feel consultation was inadequate; clarification of dining services locations for 2017-18; whether meals-to-go would be available in 2017-18; why the current model is unsustainable; clarification of which meal services locations would serve hot meals and when these would be available; whether or not the mandatory flex could be increased by \$200; the impact of spending more time on the proposal and considering it at the March 2017 Board meeting; and what other campus meal plans had been considered in developing this proposal.

Members commented on the proposal, noting: concerns that the cost of the proposed plan was prohibitive to students; that the alternate dining services locations were out-of-the-way for most students; the high level of student dissatisfaction with the proposal; that the Board was tasked with balancing the importance of flexibility for students with the financial implications raised by administration; and acknowledging the level of consultation already conducted, with a suggestion that revisions could always be made in the future.

Members and administration engaged in a discussion regarding whether or not hot meals would be available in CAB for 2017 and when full dining would be rolled out in that location. Following the discussion, a Board member suggested that administration address student concerns regarding CAB's offerings and return with a revised proposal in March.

The motion was moved and seconded.

Motion: THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Board Finance and Property Committee, approve the fees for meal services in Lister Residence at \$4650 for 7 days and \$4285 for 5 days, effective fall 2017.

DEFEATED

Mr Champagne, Ms Ficko, Mr Heelan, Mr Muzyka, Mr Parks, Mr Phair and Mr Rahman opposed.

President Turpin informed the Board that administration would return with a revised proposal early in the new year including more information regarding the proposed CAB dining services.

INFORMATION REPORTS

6. Report of the President

Presenter(s): David Turpin

6a. <u>President's Visiting Committee: Summary of Reviews for the Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry</u>
Materials before members are contained in the official meeting file.

Presenter(s): Martin Ferguson-Pell; Richard N Fedorak

Purpose of the Proposal: The Office of the President reports to governance committees on completed president's visiting committees, for their information and discussion.

Discussion:

Dr Ferguson-Pell presented a report on the recent President's Visiting Committee (PVC) review of the Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry, reviewing the history and framework of PVCs and informing members that the intent of the review was to look more strategically at research rather than coursework, and to develop and monitor a strategy toward more dynamic change in a research context. He reviewed the PVC's feedback, the response from the Faculty, and the recommendations and next steps for the Faculty.

Dr Fedorak provided members with an overview of the Faculty of Medicine and Dentistry, noting in particular the size of the faculty and its budget, the number of leadership changes over the past six years, and the elimination of the faculty's fundraising team. He indicated that he expected to follow 17 of the PVC recommendations and asked for Board of Governors' assistance with three items: reestablishing the 20 faculty positions eliminated with the conclusion of the Alberta Heritage Foundation for Medical Research (AHFMR) program; help with becoming competitive for large grants; and assistance with the issue of compounding merit.

The Chair thanked Drs Fedorak and Ferguson-Pell for their presentation and congratulated Dr Fedorak on his recent appointment as Dean.

CLOSING SESSION

7. Adjournment

Presenter(s): Michael Phair

The Chair adjourned the Open Session at 11:30 a.m.